

**138-142 cronulla street, cronulla** urban design report



20

april 2020

kennedy associates architects

abn	90 093 059 066
р	02 9557 6466
е	mail@kennedyassociates.com.au
w	www.kennedyassociates.com.au
prepared for	munro operations trust
project no.	1930
revision	a - issue for submission 26/04/2020
	This document has been prepared for the client by Kennedy Associates Architects. Reproduction of all or part of the document is prohibited without prior permission of Kennedy Associates

# table of contents

01	introduction	01	04	urban design analysis	24
	1.1 background	01		4.1 fsr amendment + proposed development	25
	1.2 about kaa	02		4.2 'gateway' site	26
	1.3 methodology	03		4.3 massing principles	27
	1.4 subject site	04		4.4 contextual fit	29
	1.4 planning proposal	05		4.5 design quality	39
02	context analysis	06	05	impacts analysis	42
	2.1 local context	06		5.1 solar impacts	43
	2.2 planning controls	10		5.2 view impacts	45
	2.3 existing built form + scale	11		5.3 privacy impacts	51
	2.4 future built form + scale	14			
	2.5 open space network	16	06	conclusion	52
	2.6 heritage	16			
	2.7 access + transport	17			
	2.8 topography	17			
	2.9 recent development	18			
03	site analysis	19			
	3.1 immediate context	20			
	3.2 access + entries	22			
	3.3 active frontages	22			
	3.4 climate	22			
	3.5 views	23			
	3.6 vistas	23			



## issued 26/04/2020 138 - 142 cronulla street, cronulla planning proposal urban design report 03

# background + team + methodology

# 1.1 background

This report has been prepared by Kennedy Associates Architects.

Kennedy Associates were engaged by Sammut Developments (hereafter the client) to prepare an urban design report in support of the planning proposal for:

### **Amended Floor Space Ratio**

at:

### 138 – 142 Cronulla Street, Cronulla

This document should be read in conjunction with the documentation accompanying the planning proposal including:

- Planning Proposal Report
   prepared by City Plan Strategy + Development
- Reference Architectural Scheme
   prepared by Innovate Architects
- Heritage Impact Statement
   prepared by NBRS Architecture
- Economics Report prepared by Atlas Urban Economics
- Traffic Report
   prepared by Ason Group

# 1.2 kaa project team

Kennedy Associates urban design team is led by Steve Kennedy.

Steve is a partner of Kennedy Associates Architects, has 35 years experience as an architect and urban designer and formed Kennedy Associates in 1994.

Steve is an architectural and urban design consultant to both local and state government and has been a member of numerous working groups, advisory boards, design excellence panels, design review panels and independent hearing and assessment panels, for over 15 years.

He has participated in over 300 panel sessions and reviewed more than 1500 projects.

Steve is currently a member of 4 Local Planning Panels as well as a member of the Sydney North Planning Panel representing Northern Beaches Council.

Steve is the author of numerous articles and papers, has presented at conferences and forums across Australia and has been a guest critic and taught architecture and urban design at several universities.

In 2014 Steve was awarded the Australian Institute of Architects NSW Presidents Prize for outstanding contribution to the architecture profession.

# 1.3 methodology

In March 2020 Kennedy Associates were approached by the client to assist with the urban design for a planning proposal / concept design for the subject site.

Kennedy Associates have previously worked with the client on an alternative planning proposal for the subject site.

In preparing this report Kennedy Associates:

- · Visited the site and its surrounds
- Attended a project briefing with the architect preparing the reference / indicative scheme (Innovate Architects)
- · Attended project meetings with the project team
- Reviewed the architectural drawings prepared by Innovate Architects
- Reviewed Local and State strategic and statutory planning documents in particular:
  - Sutherland Shire Council LEP 2015
  - Sutherland Shire Council DCP 2015
- Reviewed recent Planning Proposals and Development Applications in the vicinity of the subject site

This report evaluates the appropriateness of the proposed LEP modification (floor space ratio) and the built form massing outlined in the architectural scheme prepared by Innovate Architects in regards to the urban context of the subject site.

# 1.4 subject site



subject site and surrounds - nts

The subject site is located at:

### 138 – 142 Cronulla Street, Cronulla

The site is legally described as Lots 1 – 4 DP 18461.

The site has an area of 1424m2 and is approximately rectangular in shape with benefit of three street frontages: Cronulla Street to the west, (22.5m) Beach Park Avenue to the south, (58.7m) and Surf Lane to the east (22.5m).

The subject site is currently occupied by single storey commercial buildings used as shops, cafes and restaurants with active frontages to both Cronulla Street and Beach Avenue and loading facilities from Surf Lane.

The subject site is located directly opposite Cronulla Train Station and adjacent to Monro Park - both local heritage items. The site is located approximately 250m to the south of Cronulla Mall and 250m to the west of Cronulla Beach.

# 1.5 proposal

The planning proposal, for which this report provides support, seeks the following amendment to the Sutherland Shire Local Environmental Plan 2015, for the subject site:

### Amended FSR 2.9:1

No amendment is sought to the zoning or permissible building height of the subject site.

In support of the planning proposal, Innovate Architects have prepared a draft architectural scheme outlining the proposed development which the planning proposal seeks specifically to enable.

The proposed development includes:

- basement parking
- 2 levels of commercial tenancy, intended to be occupied by a food and beverage venue/s
- a further 5 levels of commercial tenancy, intended to be occupied by:
  - 'co-working' / short term commercial space
  - o traditional / longer term commercial tenancies
- a series of balcony / terrace areas, at all levels above ground

In conjunction with the proposed LEP amendment, a site specific DCP will be prepared.



proposed development - street interface (supplied)



# context analysis

# locality plan - immediate context

The subject site is located in the heart of the commercial, retail and recreational centre of Cronulla.

The subject site has benefit of three street frontages - Cronulla Street (west), Beach Park Avenue (south) and Surf Lane (east). Cronulla Street is a busy local street and is partially pedestrianised (to the north) to form Cronulla Mall. Surf lane functions predominately as a service lane for businesses. Beach Park Avenue is a pedestrianised through site link.

The subject site is in close proximity to both Cronulla and North Cronulla Beaches (to the east) and Gunnamatta Bay (to the west). Cronulla Mall is located to the north.



# 2.1 local context

# locality plan



# 2.1 local context cont'd

# cronulla urban structure

The subject site is located towards the southern end of the 'Cronulla Commercial Core' (hereafter Cronulla Centre) precinct, as outlined in Sutherland Shire DCP 2015.

The Centre stretches from Kingsway in the north to the end of the railway yard in the south and contains predominately commercial uses, with some mixed use / residential developments towards the periphery. A 'cluster' of tall 11 - 14 storey buildings is located at the northern termination of the mall, at the Kingsway.

Cronulla Mall – which terminates at the subject site – forms the central spine of the Centre, functions as both a commercial / retail hub and a civic and cultural meeting place. The northern, pedestrianised section is most heavily patronised, with connections to the nearby library and community centre, as well as some recent redevelopment and public domain upgrades.

Cronulla Station is located immediately adjacent to the subject site, to the west, whilst Cronulla Beach is located approximately 250m to the east. The connection between the two forms the second major pedestrian link in the Centre.

The subject site is located next to Monro Park (to the south), a heritage listed formal park containing an ANZAC war memorial.

The location of the subject site – being the intersection of the Station, Monro Park, Mall and Beach – places the site at a key geographic point of Cronulla, giving it unique prominence in Cronulla's urban structure. In acknowledgment of this, Sutherland Shire DCP 2015 identifies the subject site as a 'gateway location' to be emphasised by building and landscape.

# legend



# cronulla structure diagram



1:8,000 @ A4

# 2.1 local context cont'd

local context photos



cronulla beach





cronulla mall - south end









mixed use development on gerrale st



residential development in neighbourhood

# 2.2 planning controls

# land use zones



local context - permissible building height

As discussed, the subject site is located within the Cronulla Commercial Core Precinct, which is defined by the extent of the B3 – Commercial Core Land Use Zone.

Permissible uses in the B3 zone include: commercial premises, community facilities, education facilities, medical centre, recreation and function centres and hotels.

Areas adjacent to the Centre are predominately zoned R4 – High Density Residential with a range of residential typologies and supportive uses permissible.

# permissible building height



local context - permissible building height

Permissible building heights within the Centre vary between:

- 13m (3 4 storeys approx.)
- 30m (9 10 storeys approx.)

The subject site has a permissible building height of:

25m (6 – 7 storeys approx.)

Other sites along Cronulla Mall / Cronulla Street generally have a permissible height of 20m whilst properties fronting Gerrale Street (a block to the east of the subject site) have a greater allowable height of 30m

# permissible floor space ratio



local context - permissible floor space ratio

The subject site has a permissible FSR of 2 : 1.

Other sites along Cronulla Mall / Cronulla Street are generally subject to the same FSR standard as the subject site, with a greater (2.5 :1) FSR allowable on some sites, to the immediate north west of the subject site.

Sites along Gerrale Street have a larger permissible FSR, of 3 :1

The areas immediately adjacent to Cronulla Centre have permissible FSRs of 1.2-1.5 :1.



# 2.3 existing built form + scale

# existing built form - building heights

As illustrated opposite, the heights of existing development in the context of the subject site varies significantly, incorporating buildings from:

1 storey to 14 storeys

As will be discussed further on the following page, although the scale of development within Cronulla appears almost 'random' – at least in terms of building heights – some broad trends are evident.

The majority of the taller (8 - 14 storeys) built forms are situated to the east of Cronulla Mall, along Gerrale Street, the main vehicular thoroughfare through Cronulla. However, taller developments are not exclusive to this area, with a number distributed throughout the wider urban fabric.

Similarly, the majority of lower forms (1 - 2 storeys) are located along Cronulla Mall, a 'traditional' retail strip.

In between these two 'extremes' of building heights a full range of building heights is evident in the locality, with a significant portion of developments of between 3 - 7 storeys in height distributed throughout the Cronulla Centre.

Development in the residential area to the south of the Centre displays a similar variety of building heights with heights of between 1 - 11 storeys apparent.

However, this area displays a greater level of consistency in building heights, with a predominant building height of 3 - 4 storeys.

# cronulla existing built form - heights



 subject site
 3 - 4st height
 5 - 6st height

 7 - 8st height
 9 - 10 st height
 11+st height

1:5,000 @ A4

existing building heights (data source: google streetview + sutherland shire council DA tracker)

kennedy associates architects

# 2.3 existing built form + scale cont'd

# existing built form - bulk + scale

Notwithstanding the apparent variety in building heights evident in the context of the subject site, the built form of Cronulla Centre can be grouped broadly into three 'zones' which display different – but consistent – built form and scale characteristics.

As illustrated opposite, these 'clusters' have a close relationship to the access and movement patterns of the area, following its primary vehicular and pedestrian routes. These built form / scale zones can be described as follows:

### Cronulla Mall: Low Density

- 1 2 storeys
  - small buildings on narrow lots
  - older commercial / retail developments
  - typical mid 2oth century 'retail mall'

### Gerrale Street: Medium – High Density

- 2 14 storeys
- predominately 8 11 storeys
- mix of contemporary and older development
- residential / mixed-use typologies
- · large footprint buildings on amalgamated lots

### Beach Park Avenue: Medium Density

- 3 9 storeys
- · mix of contemporary and older developments
- residential / mixed use typologies
- medium / large footprint buildings on a variety of lot sizes

As illustrated opposite, the subject site is located at the intersection of these built form / character zones, forming:

- the termination of Cronulla Mall
- the connection between Cronulla Station and Gerrale Street

As such, the subject site is located at a key location in the existing urban fabric of Cronulla, providing the 'link' between the low scale of Cronulla Mall and the high density of Gerrale Street.

low density development

# legend

subject site

cronulla mall

medium - high density development gerrale strreet -> pedestrian link

medium density

development

# cronulla existing built form - bulk and scale



existing built form + scale (data source: google streetview + sutherland shire council DA tracker)

# 2.3 existing built form + scale cont'd

section a - cronulla st looking east - existing



key map

# section b - beach ave looking north - existing



# 2.4 future built form + scale

# future built form - bulk + scale

As outlined in section 2.2, the future built form of the Cronulla Centre, as described by SSLEP includes building heights of between 16 - 30m (4 - 9 storeys) and densities of between 2.0 - 3.0: 1

In addition to the development standards outlined in SSLEP, SSDCP 2015 provides more in depth requirements for future development, including detailed building envelopes as shown, in the adjacent model.

As illustrated opposite, severall areas are anticipated to undergo substantial transformation including:

### **Cronulla Mall**

- · transformation from retail strip to medium density precinct
- building height of up to 6 storeys (currently 1 2 storeys)
- density of between 2.0 2.5:1
- amalgamated lots and consistent 'street wall'

### **Gerrale Street**

- infill developments, completing the medium high density 'strip'
- building heights of up to 9 storeys
- density of 3.0 :1

### Surrounding Monro Park

- continuation of the built form established in the north of the centre, through to the south of the centre
- 9 storey development along Geralle Street
- · 6 storey developments in line with Cronulla Mall

As previously discussed, the subject site is located at a key intersection in the existing built form of Cronulla. This 'link' condition is retained – if not intensified – in the future anticipated built form of Cronulla, with the subject site providing transition between areas of substantially different scales and densities, specifically:

- to the north / north-west: 6 storeys / 2.0-2.5 :1 fsr
- to the east: 9 st / 3:1 fsr
- to the west: 1 st heritage train station
- to the south: 0 st heritage park



# cronulla future built form - bulk and scale



future anticipated built form + scale (data source: google streetview + sutherland shire council DA tracker + ssdcp 2015 + sslep 2015)

# 2.4 future built form + scale cont'd

section a - cronulla st looking east - future anticipated



# key map

section b - beach ave looking north - future anticipated



# open space + heritage

# 2.5 open space

# 2.6 heritage





local context - environmental heritage

local context - open space network

Cronulla is well serviced by a range of open spaces – with six individual parks located within 600m of the train station and commercial centre – totalling over 13 Ha of recreational space.

Together, the parks form a green space network, with each contributing to the overall character of Cronulla whilst also offering a unique landscape character and a variety of different experiences and facilities.

Open spaces within Cronulla include; beaches and beach side parks, coastal walks, sports grounds, large areas of bushland and a formal park – Monro Park – located adjacent to the subject site, in the centre of the urban area.

Cronulla has a rich built and landscaped heritage.

The subject site is located adjacent to the state significant Cronulla Railway Station – an example of Inter-War Functionalist style railway buildings – constructed during the great depression (1939).

Monro Park, a local heritage item, is located immediately to the south of the site. The park is formal in style and contains an ANZAC war memorial, heritage plantings, a bus shelter and some bench style seating.

The low scale nature of the adjoining heritage items lends a high degree of visibility to the site, which is unlikely to be 'built out' over time.



### kennedy associates architects

# access + topography

# 2.7 movement + access



local context - movement and access networks

The subject site is well located with regard to local and regional access.

The subject site is located adjacent to Cronulla Station, which connects the area to Sydney's CBD via the T4 Eastern Suburbs + Illawarra Line.

The site is at the intersection of major pedestrian routes through the Cronulla Centre and towards the beach. On road cycleways are available throughout the Cronulla Centre.

Major vehicular connections are available to the north (Kingsway) and east (Gerrale Street) whilst the streets surrounding the subject site are more local in character and traffic volume.

# 2.8 topography



local context - topography (data source: nearmaps elevational data)

The landform around the subject site falls substantially to the east and west (towards the water) whilst rising gently to the north and south.

Whilst the fall to the east is gentle, the fall to the west is steep. As such, buildings to the west of the train line appear lower in the skyline.

The site's location – at the rise between two water bodies – positions development on the site as a focal point for the surrounding landscape.

Conversely, the gentle slope to the north and south ensures that development on the site appears consistent with other developments in the Cronulla Centre, particularly the taller buildings to the north.



# 2.9 recent applications

recent DA applications - map

# recent DA applications - similar scale

A number of development applications have been recently lodged and / or approved in the vicinity of the subject site. As outlined below, the majority of these applications are for residential or mixed-use developments. Some applications for commerical 'alts+adds' have also been lodged.

### DA18/0323 - 22/03/2018 (1)

5-9 Ozone Street, CRONULLA

Demolition of existing structures, construction of a RFB: HOB 9 st FSR 3:1 (Approved)

DA17/0885 - 13/07/2017

### (2) 49-57 Gerrale Street, CRONULLA

Demolition of existing structures, construction of RFB: HOB 10 st FSR 3.1:1 (Approved - Under Construction)

### DA18/1391 - 29/11/2018

11 Tonkin Street, CRONULLA Demolition of existing structures, construction of RFB: HOB 6 st FSR 2:1 (Pending)

### DA18/1498 - 21/12/2018

44 Gerrale Street, CRONULLA Demolition of existing structures, construction of RFB: HOB 4 st FSR 1.5:1 (Pending)

### DA18/0504 - 01/05/2018 (5)

3-5 Parramatta Street, CRONULLA Demolition of existing structures, construction of RFB: HOB 5 st FSR 1.5:1 (Approved)

### DA18/0405 - 10/04/2018 (6)

10 Boorima Place, CRONULLA Demolition of existing structures, construction of RFB: HOB 4 st FSR 1.5:1 (Approved)

DA18/1399 - 30/11/2018

### 1-3 Roker Street, CRONULLA

Demolition of existing structures, construction of RFB: HOB 5 st FSR 1.5:1 (Pending)

legend

subject site

similar development commercial DA

1:5,000 @ A4

recent DA applications - map (data: google maps + nearmaps + Sutherland Shire council)





site analysis

# 3.1 immediate context

# locality plan

The subject site is approximately rectangular in shape and has an area of 1424sqm. It is comprised of 4 narrow lots and forms the termination of Cronulla Mall, which extends to the north along Cronulla Street

Development in the immediate vicinity of the subject site varies considerably.

The area to the east (across Surf lane) is predominately residential, including both older buildings of 4-7 storeys and newer 10 storey developments. Some of the newer developments contain commercial uses at the ground floor.

Development to the north of the subject site consists predominately of older commercial buildings, of 1 - 2 storeys. This area displays a fine grain, with small building on narrow lots, typical of 20th century retail malls.

Monro Park is located directly to the south of the subject site. It provides a substantial piece of open space within the Cronulla Centre. Development surrounding the park is a mix of residential and commercial uses.

Development to the West is separated from the Cronulla Centre (and subject site) by the rail line and a steep drop in topography. This area includes residential and recreational uses adjacent to Gunnamatta Bay.

A number of heritage buildings are located in close proximity to the subject site, including the adjacent Cronulla Station.

Some substantial street tree plantings are evident in the locality, particularly along Cronulla Street and Beach Park Avenue. Off street parking is available adjacent to Cronulla Park and on Surf Road.

# legend





# 3.1 immediate context cont'd

immediate context photos



subject site - south west corner from cronulla st



subject site - south east corner from gerrale st



monro park from subject site residential development in background



cronulla station - view from subject site



monro park from subject site at ground level



view down beach park avenue from subject site

# entries + frontages + climate

# 3.2 entries + access



immediate context - access and transport

The subject site is located directly opposite Cronulla Station and associated bus stops.

The site is at the intersection of two major pedestrian thoroughfares, connecting the station to the mall and beach. Vehicular traffic in the area is generally 'local' in character, with more significant traffic along Gerrale Street to the east.

Vehicular access to developments is generally via Surf Lane. Pedestrian entries to developments are concentrated along Cronulla Street (which becomes Cronulla Mall) and Gerrale Street. Some entries to older developments are available from the southern section of Surf Lane.

# legend subject site park ← > pedestrian link ← > major road → pedestrian entry → vehicle entry ∧ active frontage /// cronu

# 3.3 active street frontages



immediate context - active street frontages

The streets around the subject site are generally highly activated, with the exception of Surf Lane, which functions primarily as a service lane.

Cronulla Street – which becomes Cronulla Mall – has active street frontages along both sides of the street.

Existing development on the subject site activates Beach Park Avenue, via a series of small shop fronts. This activity is not continued for the full length of the beach connection along Beach Park Avenue.

Gerrale Street is activated north of Beach Park Avenue, with the southern portion containing mostly older style apartment buildings.

# 3.4 climate



immediate context - climactic conditions

The subject site has a primary street frontage to the south, with secondary frontages to the east and west. Although the subject site has a limited northern aspect, solar access is available from the east and west facing frontages. Additionally, the B3 zone in which the subject site is located predominately permits commerical uses, for which northerly aspect is less important. As such, development on the subject site should be capable of acheiving an acceptable level of solar access.

As the subject site is located directly to the north of the heritage listed Monro Park, development on the subject site will need to ensure appropriate solar amenity is retained to the park, particularly in the cooler months.

The site is well located to take advantage of both warm and cool sea breezes, from the north-east and south respectively.

Active f	ontage	cronulla mall		
		50	125m	1:2,500 @ A4

kennedy associates architects

issued 26/04/2020 138 - 142 cronulla street, cronulla planning proposal urban design report 22

# views + vistas

3.6 local vistas

# 3.5 views



immediate context - access and transport

Views, including water views, are likely to be available from the subject site, at upper levels as a result of its relatively high location in the area's topography.

Views to Gunammatta Bay and beyond are likely to be available over the top of the low scale buildings to the west, including the heritage listed station.

Views to Cronulla Beach (to the east) are likely to be largely obscured by the existing apartment developments along Gerrale Street.

District views are also available across the open space of Monro Park to the south.

# legend



immediate context - climactic conditions

In terms of the immediate context, development on the subject site will be highly visible from Monro Park, Cronulla Station and the streets to the immediate west, south and east of the subject site.

View to the subject site from the wider context are likely to be obscured by the existing and future built form of the Cronulla Centre. Partial views to the subject site may be available on approach from both Cronulla Mall and Beach Park Avenue.





# urban design analysis

# 4.1 the proposal

# planning proposal

The planning proposal, for which this report provides support, seeks the following amendment to the Sutherland Shire Local Environmental Plan 2015, for the subject site:

### Amended FSR 2.9:1

No amendment is sought to the zoning of the site, or the permissible building height.

The proposal seeks to exceed the currently permissible control by:

Additional FSR + 0.9 : 1

In support of the planning proposal, Innovate Architects have prepared a draft architectural scheme outlining the proposed development, which the planning proposal seeks specifically to enable.

The draft architectural scheme outlines how the additional floor space is intended to be distributed on the subject site. The proposed massing includes a 2 storey (8m) podium with 5 'stepped' levels above.

The proposed massing incorporates the following minimum setbacks, at ground / podium level

Cronulla St	<b>0m</b> (approx.)	
Beach Park Ave	3m (approx.)	
Surf Ln	3m (approx.)	

Above podium setbacks vary with the 'stepped' floor plates, as follows:

Cronulla St	<b>0m</b> (approx.)
Beach Park Ave	6m - 16m (approx.)
Surf Ln	7m – 19m (approx.)

The proposed development, which the planning proposal seeks to facilitate, includes a mix of commercial uses, incorporating a food and beverage venue, traditional office space and potential 'co-working' space.

subject site

proposed massing





# beach park avenue elevation

# axonometric view



# cronulla street elevtion



# 4.2 'gateway' site

# the subject site

As outlined in section 2 of this report, the subject site has been identified as a 'gateway' location in SSDCP DCP 2015. This identification is a result of the unique characteristics of the subject site. Specifically:

- its location next to Cronulla Station
- its position at the intersection of two major pedestrian paths
- its relationship to Monro Park, and visibility in the locality
- · the topography of the area, in particular its place on a ridge
- its position at the nexus of different built form / scale character areas, in both the existing and future anticipated context

The subject site has the potential to be a key element of the urban structure of Cronulla – it connects major attractions and services, is highly activated at the ground plane, is afforded exceptional amenity and provides transition between different built form scales.

An appropriate, well considered development on the subject site – that maximises and reinforces its gateway characteristics – has the potential to strengthen the overall urban structure of the centre and improve the experience of the urban environment, creating a 'landmark' which appropriately signifies and activates the surrounding urban elements.

As such, some quantum of additional development potential is considered appropriate for – and valuable to – the subject site and the wider context.

This is partially acknowledged by the currently applicable planning controls for the subject site, which allow for a single storey of additional height, over that permissible for other sites on Cronulla Street. However no additional development potential (fsr) is currently permitted.

Given the nature and potential of the site, a development of the scale proposed is not considered fundamentally inappropriate.

building

In fact, in our opinionit can be argued that a larger building on the subject site is consistent with the subject site's landmark and gateway character.

building - heritage



subject site

# 4.3 massing principles

2. residential to commercial

# 1. dcp massing



council massing data source: sutherland shire dcp 2015

The massing strategy of the proposed scheme is based on the massing outlined in Sutherland Shire DCP 2015.

The DCP outlines the following massing elements:

Setbacks to Surf Lane + Beach Park Avenue A podium, of 2 storeys A tower, located primarily to the west

The DCP massing is based on facilitating a 'shop top housing' development comprised of 2 storeys of commercial and 5 storeys of residential above.

Council's massing appears to have been largely derived from:

- a desire to create a focal point on the corner of Cronulla Street
   and Beach Park Avenue
- a building mass and built form based on the recommendations of the NSW Apartment Design Guide (ADG).

However, this Planning Proposal is based on providing commercial uses only on the subject site.



The DCP massing, it is assumed, was designed to facilitate residential development on the upper floors.

As such, it allowed for building separations, balconies and building depths compliant with the Apartment Design Guide.

As the proposed scheme is intended for commercial uses only, these floor plate parameters are no longer applicable. For commercial uses, larger floor plates are generally more desirable and functional.

Moreover, the constraints in terms of setbacks and daylighting applied to residential projects are no longer applicable.

Therefore, in order to facilitate the proposed commercial uses it is reasonable to adjust the floor plates beyond that proposed in the DCP.

Given the above, the location and proportion of the proposed built form is generally in accordance with the principles set by the DCP massing.

The majority - approximately 995sqm or 0.7:1 in FSR - of the proposed additional floor space is contained within this lower podium of the proposed development

# 2. corner activation



proposed massing - upper podium + tower form

The subject site is identified as a 'gateway' location in Sutherland Shire DCP 2015. It is located at the intersection between two major pedestrian links, connecting the station, beach and mall.

As such, the site – in particular the south west corner – will have the potential to be highly activated in terms of pedestrian traffic and will from a key point in the urban structure, and public domain experience of the Cronulla Centre.

To reinforce the urban design significance of the corner – at the street level – it is proposed that the massing of the lower podium be sculpted to create a feature in the south east corner of the site.

This feature emphasises the corner visually, creates an inviting and clearly defined entry point to ground floor uses and further activates the surrounding public domain.

At the upper levels, the subject site's prominent location is emphasised through a vertical 'pop-out', at the north west corner of the subject site, opposite Cronulla Station.

# 4.3 massing principles cont'd

# 4. additional floor space

proposed scheme



proposed massing - lift and services

Some additional building volume is proposed, at levels 04 + 05 of the proposed development.

As discussed, the majority (995sqm / 0.7:1) of the proposed additional floor space sought by the planning proposal is located within the podium.

That is, the amount of additional floor space contained in these additional volumes is limited to approximatley 285sqm, or 0.2:1 in FSR.

Further the location and size of the proposed additional volumes has been carefully considered to respond to the constraints of the subject site and its position within the urban assemblage of Cronulla.

Specifically, the size and shape of the proposed additional volume has been 'sculpted' to ensure that the proposed development results in no additional solar impacts on the adjacent Monro Park, above that resulting from the massing outlined in Sutherland Shire DCP 2015. (Refer section 5.2 Solar Impacts)

The proposed additional volumes are located away from the street frontages of the subject site, with 'stepped' setbacks, increasing at upper levels.

proposed massing - overall form

The proposed massing strategy has a high level of consistency with the objectives and composition of Council's anticipated form for the subject site, as outlined in Sutherland Shire DCP 2015.

In particular it:

- incorporates a 2 storey podium, built to the Cronulla Street Boundary
- includes a 5 storey 'tower', in the location identified by Council, of a shape and size commensurate with Council's intent
- visually and physically emphasises the significant corner of the subject site, adjacent to Cronulla Station and Monro Park
- locates additional massing away from street frontages
- · does not exceed the applicable height standard for the site

Articulation in the proposed massing - including curved corners and recesses - creates further visual interest.

As such, the massing strategy is considered an appropriate approach for distributing floor space on the subject site.

# 4.4 contextual fit

# contextual fit - general

As outlined in section 2.2, the subject site has a permissible floor space ratio of 2.0: 1.

The proposed LEP amendment seeks an increase to the permissible floor space to a maximum of 2.9:1.

That is, the planning proposal seeks an additional:

### + 0.9 : 1

of floor space ratio, an increase of approximately 45%.

As previously discussed, the subject site can be considered – and is identified in Sutherland Shire DCP 2015 as – an important 'gateway' site within the urban structure of the Cronulla Centre.

As also discussed, in our opinion, some quantum of additional development potential is considered appropriate the subject site.

Further, the subject site can be seen to be particularly important to the urban and economic development of Cronulla – in particular the southern end of the Cronulla Centre. Currently, much of the economic and urban activity is concentrated towards the north, with the south underperforming in terms of both economic contribution and urban amenity.

Appropriate, well considered development on the subject site has the potential to act as a catalyst for the redevelopment of the southern end of the Cronulla Centre.

Further, as outlined in section 4.3, the proposed development achieves a high level of consistency with Council's intended built form outcome for the subject site. Specifically it:

- reflects the massing principles outlined in SSDCP 2015
- is wholly contained within the 25m height plane set by SSLEP 2015

As such, the proposed development is not considered fundamentally incompatible with the built form context of Cronulla. In fact, the proposed development is generally as anticipated – and considered acceptable – for the subject site.

# key considerations

Given this, in our opinion, the proposed amendment to Sutherland Shire Council LEP 2015 – and the proposed development it seeks to facilitate – is a reasonable approach to the redevelopment of the subject site.

Specifically, as demonstrated in the following analysis, the proposed development:

- is of a bulk and scale commensurate with or less than existing developments in the immediate locality
- is of a bulk and scale commensurate with or less than that anticipated for the redevelopment of other sites in the immediate locality
- incorporates a mix of uses food / beverage, co-working and commercial space – that have the potential to stimulate both urban and economic activity in the south end of the Cronulla Centre
- appropriately locates the proposed additional floor space, with regards to the conditions of the subject site

Further, in our opinion, the proposed development (which the planning proposal seeks to facilitate) has the potential to contribute positively to the urban environment of Cronulla and provide an appropriate, attractive and safe place to work and visit.

Notwithstanding this, in our opinion, the appropriateness of the proposed development, in urban design terms, depends on a number of key considerations. Specifically:

- its response to and fit within the existing context of Cronulla
- its response to and fit within the anticipated future context of Cronulla
- · its design quality and visual appearance
- the acceptability of any impacts

# 4.4 contextual fit - existing built form

# relationship to existing context

As discussed, the proposed development achieves a high level of consistency with Council's intended built form for the subject site, complying with the height standard set by SSLEP 2015 and reflecting the massing principles outlined in SSDCP 2015.

As such, the proposed development is largely as anticipated, and considered acceptable, for the subject site.

Additionally, as illustrated opposite, the proposed development is of a similar – or lesser – bulk and scale when compared with a number of existing / under construction developments in the locality. In particular, those to the immediate east along Gerrale Street, fronting Monro Park.

Further, in our opinion, the additional floor space sought has been appropriately 'sculpted', with regards to both the existing built form context of the subject site and its role as a 'gateway' within the urban structure of Cronulla. Specifically

- the majority of the additional floor space is contained within the podium, adjacent to existing 'built to boundary' developments
- that is, most of the additional floor space is not 'readable', from the public domain, in particular from Monro Park
- a small portion of additional massing approximately 285sqm or 0.2 : 1 in fsr – is incorporated at levels 04 + 05 of the proposed development
- this 'visible' portion is a minor increase in development capacity 10% of the permissible fsr
- the additional massing at levels 04 + 05 has been appropriately configured to:
  - 'step down' to residential neighbours to the east, and Monro Park to the south, reducing visual prominence and mitigating potential impacts
  - istep up' to the 7 storey tower, providing a visible 'landmark' adjacent to the station, consistent with the subject site's role as a 'gateway'

As such, in our opinion the proposed development responds appropriately to the significance of the subject site and achieves an appropriate fit in the existing built form context of Cronulla

# proposed development in existing context



(data source: google streetview + sutherland shire council DA tracker)

-> pedestrian link

proposed massing

low density development cronulla mall medium density development medium - high density development gerrale strreet

# 4.4 contextual fit - existing built form cont'd

Image: state state

section a - cronulla st looking east - existing context + proposed development

section b - beach ave looking north - existing context + proposed development



key map

# 4.4 contextual fit - future built form

# relationship to future context

As previously discussed, the planning controls for the Cronulla Centre describe a not insubstantial amount of anticipated built form transformation.

Included in this transformation is:

- the redevelopment of Cronulla Mall, from a 1-2 storey aging retail • strip to a 6 storey vibrant precinct
- the 'infill' of Gerrale Street, to a consistent 9 storey datum •

The redevelopment of Cronulla Mall, in particular, is highly desired to reinvigorate urban and economic activity in the southern end of the Cronulla Centre. To facilitate this, floor space ratios of between 2.0 - 2.5:1 are applicable to sites fronting Cronulla Mall.

That is, sites along the length of Cronulla Mall are likely to be redeveloped to the same - or greater - development capacity as currently allowable on the subject site

As previously discussed, in our opinion, some quantum of additional development capacity is not only appropriate for the subject site, but also potentially beneficial for the urban environment of Cronulla.

In our opinion, this is particularly relevant with regard to the anticipated future context of Cronulla, which, as illustrated opposite, is likely to contain built forms that are predominately of a similar - if not greater - scale than the proposed development.

In addition to the reasons given previously - which continue to be relevant in our opinion, the additional floor space sought is appropriate with regards to both the future built form context of the subject site and its role as a 'gateway' within the urban structure of Cronulla. Specifically

- it allows the subject site to continue to fulfill its 'gateway' function, within a context of substantially greater bulk and scale
- its provides an appropriate transitional scale between areas of • different built form density: from 6 storeys / 2.0 – 2.5 : 1 along the mall, to 9 storeys 3.0 : 1 along Gerrale Street

As such, in our opinion the proposed development responds appropriately to the significance of the subject site and achieves an appropriate fit within the future built form context of the subject site.

# proposed development in future context

existing built form

allowable fsr 2:1

proposed massing



future anticipated

envelope fsr 3:1

### (data source: google streetview + sutherland shire council DA tracker + ssdcp 2015 + sslep 2015)

future anticipated

envelope fsr 2.5:1

future anticipated envelope fsr 2:1

future development sth monro park fsr 1.5 - 3

138 - 142 cronulla street, cronulla planning proposal urban design report 32 issued 26/04/2020

# 4.4 contextual fit - future built form cont'd

section a - cronulla st looking east - future context + proposed development



key map

section b - beach ave looking north - future context + proposed development



# 4.4 contextual fit cont'd

# appearance in context

As previously discussed, the proposed development achieves an appropriate fit – in terms of bulk and scale – within the existing and future built form of Cronulla.

Notwithstanding this, as a result of:

- its position adjacent to Monro Park
- the relatively low scale of existing development along Cronulla Mall

the proposed development will be visible from key 'moments' within the urban fabric, in the immediate context of the subject site.

These 'moments' contribute to the 'feel' and character of the southern end of the Cronulla Centre. As such, the proposed development's appearance from, and contribution to, these key moments is important in assessing its overall contextual fit.

The following pages provide detailed analysis of the appearance of the proposed development – in comparison with SSDCP compliant massing – when viewed from:

1 Cronulla Mall A From Cronulla Street, Near Ocean Grove Ave

2 Cronulla Mall B From Cronulla Street, Near Purley Place

3 Surf Road From corner Surf Lane

(4) Beach Park Avenue / Cronulla Beach From end of Beach Park Ave, at connection to Cronulla Beach

building

proposed development

5 Monro Park A From south-east corner of Monro Park

6 Monro Park B From south-west corner of Monro Park

subject site

key view from public domain



key views in surrounding context

1:5,000 @ A4

# vistas 01 + 02 - cronulla mall

(a)

existing context + ssdcp massing

# vista 01 - mall @ ocean grove ave

- the proposed development is partially visible, when viewed from this location in the existing context
- specifically, the top two storeys of the proposed development appear to be visible, above the existing built form of Cronulla Mall
- the proposed development appears materially the same as a scheme compliant with the massing outlined in SSDCP
- that is, there is no additional visual impact on this view, as a result of the additional floor space sought
- further, when redeveloped, the anticipated 6 storey building heights along Cronulla Mall will obscure the proposed development from view



approximate view to subject site from cronulla street near ocean grove ave existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

# vista 02 - mall @ purley ave

- the proposed development is partially visible, when viewed from this location in the existing context
- specifically, the top two storeys of the proposed development appear to be visible, above the existing built form of Cronulla Mall
- the proposed development appears materially the same as a scheme compliant with the massing outlined in SSDCP
- that is, there is no additional visual impact on this view, as a result of the additional floor space sought
- further, when redeveloped, the anticipated 6 storey building heights along Cronulla Mall will obscure the proposed development from view

subject site massing

parks

# a existing context + ssdcp massing

# **b** existing context + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from cronulla street near ocean grove ave existing built form + proposed massing

# $oldsymbol{b}$ existing context + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from cronulla street near purley ave existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from cronulla street near purley ave existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing



water body
#### vistas 03 + 04 - surf lane + beach park ave

### vista 03 - surf road @ surf lane

- the proposed development is partially visible, when viewed from this location in the existing context
- some additional building volume is visible, when compared to a SSDCP compliant massing
- specifically, the additional floor space proposed at levels 04 + 05 is partially visible
- as previously discussed, the visible additional floor space is minor in scale (0.2:1 or 10% of the currently permissible floor space)
- further, this additional floor space is maintained within the anticipated
  massing zone described by SSLEP + SSDCP
- the additional volume is stepped away from Surf Lane, minimising its visual impact
- as such, in our opinion, the proposed development achieves an acceptable appearance, from this location

#### vista 04 - beach park ave @ beach

- the proposed development is partially visible, when viewed from this location
- specifically, a small 'slice' of the whole building appears to be visible, to the left of existing development along Beach Park Ave
- the proposed development appears materially the same as a scheme compliant with the massing outlined in SSDCP
- that is, there is no additional visual impact on this view, as a result of the additional floor space sought

subject site massing

parks

### **a** existing context + ssdcp massing



approximate view to subject site from surf rd near surf ln existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

#### **a** existing context + ssdcp massing

**b** existing context + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from surf rd near surf ln existing built form + proposed massing

#### **b** existing context + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from beach park ave near cronulla beach existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from beach park ave from cronulla beach existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

existing built form

#### vistas 05 + 06 - monro park

### vista 05 - monro park @ southeast cnr

### (a) existing context + ssdcp massing

#### **b** existing context + proposed massing

- · the proposed development is highly visible, from this location
- some additional building volume is visible from this location, when compared to SSDCP compliant massing
- as previously discussed, the visible additional floor space is a minor in scale (0.2:1 or 10% of the currently permissible floor space)
- additionally, as previously discussed, this floor space has been specifically sculpted to minimise is impacts on Monro Park
- specifically, the additional floor space is substantially setback from the frontage of the proposed development, reducing its visual prominence
- further, this additional floor space is maintained within the anticipated massing zone described by SSLEP + SSDCP
- in fact, in our opinion, the stepped massing provides a more balanced and visually attractive built form than that anticipated by SSDCP
- as such, in our opinion, the proposed development achieves an acceptable appearance, from this location

vista 06 - monro park @ southwest cnr

approximate view to subject site from southeast corner of monro park existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

(a) existing context + ssdcp massing



approximate view to subject site from southeast corner of monro park existing built form + proposed massing

 ${f b}$  existing context + proposed massing

as above



approximate view to subject site from southwest corner of monro park existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view to subject site from southwest corner of monro park existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing



#### 4.4 contextual fit cont'd

#### view analysis methodology

Views shown are approximate only. Views from surrounding context and site modelling have been developed using the following methodology:

#### Terrain:

The surrounding terrain has been modelled from elevation
 profile data available from nearmaps.com

#### **Existing Context:**

- Existing buildings footprints have been modelled from aerial photography from nearmaps.com
- Existing building heights have been modelled from desktop analysis of no. storeys (google street view) and the oblique height measurement tool from nearmaps.com
- Where building height could not be measured, a floor to floor height of 3.1m (residential) and 4.5m (commercial) was used to approximate overall building height, +/- 1m.

#### Future Context:

• Future built form has been modelled from permissible HOB outlined in SS LEP 2015 and massing diagrams outlined in SS DCP 2015

#### View Framing:

- Views have been estimated by placing a normal perspective camera at the approximate ground level (+/- 0.5m)
- This camera has been set at a height of 1.5m, approximating eye level and has a 'look to point' straight ahead.

#### appearance in context

As previously discussed, as a result of the existing built form and topography of the area, the proposed development is largely obscured from much of the surrounding context, including – as demonstrated in the preceding pages – a number of key 'moments' within the immediate locality.

Further, as also previously discussed, the majority of the proposed additional floor space is contained within the podium of the proposed development and, as such, is not visible from the public domain.

Notwithstanding the above, the proposed development will be highly visible from Monro Park, effectively forming a 'backdrop' for the park's activities. Further, a portion of the proposed additional floor space (0.2:1 or 10% of the currently permissible floor space) is visible, when viewed from the park

As discussed, in our opinion, the proposed development achieves an appropriate appearance when viewed from the public domain – including Monro Park. Specifically;

- the additional floor space has been 'sculpted' to minimise its visual prominence, including substantial setbacks to the Monro Park / Beach Park Avenue frontage
- the additional floor space is maintained within the massing zone described by SSLEP + SSDCP
- the additional floor space is a minor element of the proposed developments overall bulk and scale
- the proposed massing strategy reflects the principles outlined in SSDCP, including 'stepping up' to 7 storey tower, at the Cronulla Street frontage

Additionally, and importantly, the subject site is identified as a 'gateway' site with the potential and scope to 'stand out' in both the operation and appearance of Cronulla. As such, in this instance a high degree of visibility – particularly from public spaces – has the potential to be a positive, rather than a negative, trait

As such, in our opinion, when viewed within its context, the proposed development is appropriate within the 'Urban Assemblage' of Cronulla

### 4.5 design quality

#### design quality - general

As outlined above, in our opinion, the bulk and scale of the proposed development is appropriate – on its own merit – with regards to:

- its fit within the existing and future context of Cronulla
- the significance of the subject site
- appearance from key locations in the urban environment

Notwithstanding this, its acceptability also depends largely on the design quality of the proposed building. A poorly designed, poorly finished building – even of a relatively small scale – has the potential to negatively impact on the appearance and quality of the area.

Conversely and importantly, a well-considered, visually appealing building with a high degree of architectural merit – of an appropriate scale – has the potential to make a real and positive contribution to the character of Cronulla and set an appropriate precedent for design quality for the redevelopment of the southern end of the Commercial Centre

This is particularly important given the significance of the subject site in the urban structure of Cronulla.

The reference scheme, prepared by Innovate Architects, which accompanies the planning proposal outlines a high quality, well articulated and attractive architectural response that incorporates an organic form, high quality finishes and appropriate detailing.

In fact, Innovate Architects have been actively involved in establishing the emerging high quality 'contemporary' character of Cronulla, having designed a number of recently completed, and under construction developments, in the vicinity of the subject site including:

- 'Banc' at 66-70 Cronulla Street
- 'Breeze' at 19 Gerrale Street
- 'Coast' at 18-20 Coast Avenue

As such, the proposed development is expected to present positively in the locality, be attractive and inviting to users and reflect the unique character and style of Cronulla.

proposed development - view from monro park



monro park photomontage - supplied by innovate architects

### 4.5 design quality cont'd

### design quality - public domain

In addition to the high quality of its overall architectural design, the proposed development, which this planning proposal seeks to facilitate, has been carefully considered with regard to its interaction with and contribution to the public domain.

As previously discussed, the proposed development is intended to include a hospitality venue at the ground and first floors. This use not only capitalizes on the existing pedestrian activity surrounding the site, but has the potential to increase and expand this activation.

In addition to the 'active' and attractive nature of the proposed use, the proposed development has the potential to further improve and activate the public domain surrounding the subject site. In particular the proposed development:

- incorporates additional setbacks to Beach Park Avenue and Surf Lane which:
  - o create additional space for pedestrians
  - o improve vehicular access from Surf Lane
  - o allow for on street dining along Beach Park Avenue
- includes an 'active frontage' including a glazed wall to the entirety of the Cronulla and Beach Park Avenue facades
- creates a curved 'feature' at the corner of Cronulla Street and Beach Park Avenue, creating an inviting and intriguing appearance from the public domain
- visually connects to the public domain at all levels, with open t erraces providing a high degree of visibility to and from Monro park

Additionally, Kennedy Associates understands the proposed development may include:

- public toilets, in an easily accessible location
- a 'projection wall' to allow for film screenings in the park
- enhancement of the footpath and public space between the subject site and Monro Park

As such, the proposed development is considered to contribute appropriately and positively to the public domain of its locality

#### proposed development - view from cronulla street (looking east)



cronulla street photomontage 2 - supplied by innovate architects

### 4.5 design quality cont'd

### north facade

As previously discussed, the north wall of the proposed development will be partially visible from key moments in the existing built fabric of Cronulla including:

- the approach from Cronulla Mall
- the corner of Surf Land and Surf Road

As also discussed, the proposed development achieves a high level of consistency with Council's anticipated built form for the subject site, including the height of the north wall.

As such, in our opinion, the visual prominence of the north facade, in the existing context of Cronulla, is as anticipated and acceptable.

Further, as discussed, the context of the subject site is anticipated to undergo substantial built form transformation including the 'upscaling' of development along Cronulla Mall – to the north of the subject site – from 1 - 2 storeys, to a 6 storey datum.

As such, in the future anticipated context of Cronulla, the north facade will be significantly obscured from view

Further, as illustrated opposite, future development to the immediate north of the subject site is anticipated – by the massing outlined in SSDCP 2015 – so substantially 'abut' the north wall of the proposed development.

Therefore its treatment, whilst important, is temporary.

The reference design prepared by Innovate Architects:

- · addresses modelling of the north wall in a generic form
- describes proportional modelling of the facade through a combination of elements including: expressed structure, precast elements, glazed elements
- incorporates green elements (planters)
- will be subject to further design development, in later stages of the proposed developments approval process

As such, in our opinion, the treatment of the north facade is capable of providing an attractive and well articulated facade and appropriate for this stage of the proposal.





### section a - cronulla st looking east - future context + proposed development



# impact analysis

#### 5.1 solar impacts

#### overshadowing impacts

As a result of its orientation and location – directly north of Monro Park – any development on the subject site will result in overshadowing of the park.

The acceptability of this impact depends on:

- its magnitude: how much of the park continues to receive solar access
- its relationship to the heritage interpretation and significant elements of the park, in particular the ANZAC memorial
- its relationship to the impact anticipated by and considered acceptable for – a scheme compliant with Council's controls for the subject site.

As illustrated in the accompanying shadow diagrams, the proposed additional floor space has been specifically distributed to result in no additional overshadowing of Monro Park, between 9 – 3pm on the winter solstice, above that which results from massing compliant with SSDCP 2015

That is, the solar impact of the proposed development is the same as a scheme wholly compliant with Council's controls for the subject site.

#### Further:

- the majority of Monro Park remains in sun, at all hours of the winter solstice
- at no time does the shadow fall on the ANZAC Memorial located in the centre of the Park

That is, the solar impact of the proposed development will have a minimal impact on the significance and enjoyment of Monro Park.

As such, in our opinion, the solar impacts of the proposed development are as anticipated for a development of this type and scale and acceptable.

shadow - existing

shadow - proposed shadow - ssdcp compliant massing

monro park



### hourly shadow diagrams - winter solstice (9 - 12)



shadow diagram - 9am - winter solstice

shadow diagram - 10am - winter solstice



### 5.1 solar impacts cont'd

hourly shadow diagrams - winter solstice (1 - 3)



shadow diagram - 1pm - winter solstice

shadow diagram - 2pm - winter solstice



shadow - existing

shadow - proposed

monro park

#### 5.2 view impacts

#### potential view impacts

Whilst the subject site is located in a predominately commercial area, a number of nearby buildings are residential, or include residential uses.

Given the topography of the area, the existing built form of Cronulla and the apparent design and layout of the neighbouring buildings, some high level dwellings in nearby buildings may enjoy views in the direction of the subject site.

An assessment of the proposed development's potential impact on these likely available views is outlined in the following pages.

#### (1) 83-95 Gerrale Street

Northern corner balcony oriented towards site: direct view of site

 a. approximate view from level 07
 b. approximate view from level 09 (top storey)

#### 2 75 Gerrale Street

West facing balconies oriented parallel to surf lane: peripheral view of site approximate view from level 05 (top storey)

#### 3 67 Gerrale Street

West facing balconies oriented slightly south: peripheral view of site approximate view from level 04 (top storey)

#### 4 59-65 Gerrale Street 1

Corner balcony, oriented to the south-west: partial view of site approximate view from level 06 (sub penthouse)

#### 5 59-65 Gerrale Street 2

Corner balcony, oriented to the north west: partial view of site approximate view from level 06 (sub penthouse)

#### 6 49-51 Gerrale Street (Future - Under Construction)

West facing balconies, oriented parallel to Surf Lane: partial view to site
a. approximate view from level 07
b. approximate view from level 09 (to storey)

 NB: 59-65 Gerrale Street icludes a directly west facing secondary balcony, off the kitchen of the north west facing unit. Views from this secondary balcony will be significantly impacted by any development on the subject site



### views from residential neighbours



#### view 01 - 83-95 gerrale st

#### view 01a - 83-95 gerrale st - lvl 07

- as illustrated opposite, the proposed development appears to have a • minor additional impact on this view, above that resulting from massing compliant with SSDCP 2015
- specifically, the additional volume proposed at levels 04 + 05 appears to ٠ obscure a small additional portion of view to the surrounding general built context
- this portion does not appear to contain any iconic or significant ٠ elements

view 01b - 83-95 gerrale st - lvl 09

no impact is apparent on the view to Gunnamatta Bay, to the south west • of the subject site



#### existing context + proposed massing (b)





(**b**) existing context + proposed massing

approximate view from level 07 corner balcony existing built form + proposed massing

approximate view from level 07 corner balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

#### (a) existing context + ssdcp massing

as above



approximate view from level 00 corner balcony existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view from level 09 corner balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing



existing built form subject site massing

### view 02 - 75 gerrale st + view 03 - 67 gerrale st

#### view 02 - 75 gerrale st - lvl 05

- as illustrated opposite, the proposed development does not appear to result in any additional impact to this view, above that resulting from a massing compliant with SSDCP 2015
- specifically, the additional volume proposed at levels 04 + 05 is wholly contained within the line of compliant massing, when viewed from this location



**b** existing context + proposed massing





approximate view from level 05 west facing balcony existing built form + proposed massing

# $(\mathbf{b})$ existing context + proposed massing

approximate view from level 05 west facing balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

#### existing context + ssdcp massing

view 03 - 67 gerrale st - lvl 04



approximate view from level 04 south west facing balcony existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view from level 04 south west facing balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

subject site massing parks

existing built form

water body

as above

### view 04 + view 05 - 59-65 gerrale st

#### view 04-59-65 gerrale st - south

- as illustrated opposite, the proposed development does not appear to result in any additional impact to this view, above that resulting from a massing compliant with SSDCP 2015
- specifically, the additional volume proposed at levels 04 + 05 is wholly contained within the line of compliant massing, when viewed from this location

### **a** existing context + ssdcp massing

#### **b** existing context + proposed massing



approximate view from level 06 south west cnr balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

approximate view from level 06 south west cnr balcony existing built form + proposed massing

### view 05 - 59-65 gerrale st - north

#### **a** existing context + ssdcp massing

**b** existing context + proposed massing

#### as above



approximate view from level 06 north west cnr balcony existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view from level 06 north west cnr balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

existing built form subject site massing parks

#### view 06 - 49-51 gerrale st

#### view 06a - 49-51 gerrale st - lvl 07

- as illustrated opposite, the proposed development does not appear to result in any additional impact to this view, above that resulting from a massing compliant with SSDCP 2015
- specifically, the additional volume proposed at levels 04 + 05 is wholly contained within the line of compliant massing, when viewed from this location



#### **b** existing context + proposed massing



approximate view from future level 09 south west balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing



existing context + proposed massing

(**b**)

approximate view from future level 09 south west balcony existing built form + proposed massing

view 06b - 49-51 gerrale st - lvl 09

(a) existing context + ssdcp massing

as above



approximate view from future level 09 south west balcony existing built form + proposed massing



approximate view from future level 09 south west balcony existing built form + ssdcp compliant massing

existing built form subject site massing parks

#### 5.2 view impacts cont'd

#### view analysis methodology

Views shown are approximate only. Views from neighbouring developments and site modelling have been developed using the following methodology:

#### Terrain:

The surrounding terrain has been modelled from elevation
 profile data available from nearmaps.com

#### **Existing Context:**

- Existing buildings footprints have been modelled from aerial photography from nearmaps.com
- Existing building heights have been modelled from desktop analysis of no. storeys (google street view) and the oblique height measurement tool from nearmaps.com
- Where building height could not be measured, a floor to floor height of 3.1m (residential) and 4.5m (commercial) was used to approximate overall building height, +/- 1m.

#### Future Context:

• Future built form has been modelled from permissible HOB outlined in SS LEP 2015 and massing diagrams outlined in SS DCP 2015

#### **View Framing:**

- Views have been estimated by placing a normal perspective camera at the approximate floor level of the balcony (+/- 1m), perpedicular to the primary opening of the balcony
- This camera has been set at a height of 1.5m, approximating eye level and has a 'look to point' straight ahead.

#### impacts on neighbouring views

As illustrated in the preceding view analysis pages, the additional floor space sought by the planning proposal – as outlined in the accompanying reference scheme – does not appear to result in any significant view impacts, above that generated by a scheme that is fully compliant with Council's controls and anticipated outcome for the site.

Notwithstanding the above, minor additional impact may occur on views available from No. 83 – 95 Gerrale Street, at upper levels.

As illustrated in the view analysis diagrams, the additional volume proposed at levels 04 + 05 of the proposed development does appear to obscure a small additional portion of view across the general built form of Cronulla. However,

- this additional portion is very small
- it does not appear to contain any highly valuable or iconic elements such as water views or views to iconic buildings

Additionally, as also illustrated, the likely available view from the upper levels of this property appear to include partial views to the water and foreshore of Gunnamatta Bay, to the south-west of the subject site.

Neither SSDCP compliant massing or the proposed development have any impact on these views. Therefore, in our opinion additional impact as a result of the proposed development is negligible.

Additionally, as noted on page 44, although the proposed development will have a significant impact on the view from the secondary balcony at No. 59-65 Gerrale Street, this impact will result from any redevelopment of the subject site, including development wholly compliant with Council's controls for the subject site.

The proposed development does not result in any additional impact on views from any other neighbouring residential development.

Therefore, the planning proposal does not appear to result in any, additional, unanticipated or unacceptable view impacts on neighbouring residential properties.

As such, in our opinion, the view impacts of the proposed development are considered acceptable.

#### 5.3 privacy impacts

#### separations + privacy

Whilst the subject site is located in a predominately commercial area, a number of immediately neighbouring developments are residential, or include residential uses.

As such, although the provisions of the Apartment Design Guide do not strictly apply to the proposed (commercial) development, achieving appropriate building separations for aural and visual privacy, is important, in urban design terms.

As illustrated in the adjacent diagram, the proposed development incorporates substantial setbacks to existing (and under construction) residential neighbours.

Specifically, the proposed development provides:

#### 49 - 57 Gerrale Street (North East)

• minimum 22m separation

#### 59 - 63 Gerrale Street (Immediate East)

- minimum 15m separation
- between 19m 26m, at intermediate levels
- over 30m, at upper levels

#### 67 Gerrale Street (South East)

• minimum 23m separation

The above separations achieve - or exceed - the guidance for separations between residential and commercial buildings as set out in Part 3F of the Apartment Design Guide

## As such, the proposed development is not considered to result in any unacceptable privacy impacts.



#### separation to residential neighbours





### proposal in context

proposed development in existing context



### proposal in context

proposed development in future anticipated context



issued 26/04/20 138 - 142 cronulla street, cronulla planning proposal urban design report 54

#### conclusion

In our opinion, the proposed amendment to Sutherland Shire LEP 2015 – and the specific development it seeks to facilitate – are appropriate and supportable.

In our opinion, the proposed development is well considered and has the potential to achieve good urban design outcomes.

As outlined in this report – its appropriateness is based on:

### The significance of the subject site in the urban structure of the Cronulla Centre

- the subject site is identified as a gateway location in Council's DCP and, as such, a 'stand out' building is anticipated in this location
- appropriate and good quality development on the site such as that facilitated by the planning proposal - has the potential to act as a 'magnet', promoting activation of the urban environment and contributing to the revitalisation of the southern end of the Cronulla Centre.

In our opinion, the proposal responds well to the attributes of the site.

## The consistency of the proposed massing with the strategy put forward by Council

- the massing of the proposed development is consistent with and derived from the strategy put forward by Council.
- this strategy is appropriate, locating the bulk of the development closest to the station and providing a transitional podium height
- the majority of the additional proposed development capacity is located within the development's podium and is not visible from the public domain
- the portion of additional development capacity that is visible from the public domain (0.2:1 in fsr) has been 'sculpted' to minimise its visual prominence and mitigate potential impacts

#### In our opinion, the massing strategy is appropriate

### The 'fit' of the proposed development within the existing urban context of the subject site

- as discussed, the massing of the proposed development achieves a high level of consistency with Council's intended outcome for the subject site, as described by SSDCP 2015
- additionally, the proposed development is contained entirely within the 25m height limit for the subject site, established by SSLEP
- that is, the proposed development is largely as anticipated and considered acceptable for the subject site
- further, a number of developments of similar or greater scale are evident in the immediate locality
- that is, the proposed development is consistent with the bulk and scale of established built forms in the area
- further, as discussed, the distribution of the proposed additional floor space is well considered and appropriate

### In our opinion, the proposed development achieves an appropriate fit within the existing context of Cronulla

### The 'fit' of the proposed development within the future anticipated urban context of the subject site

- the urban environment of Cronulla is anticipated to undergo a not
  insubstantial amount of transformation
- this transformation includes the redevelopment of Cronulla Mall, to a height of 6 storeys and density of 2.0 – 2.5:1
- that is, developments of similar or greater bulk and scale as the proposed development are likely to be the predominate form in the future urban environment
- as such, the additional development capacity sought has the potential to allow development on the subject site to retain its 'gateway' / 'landmark' function, in this future context

### In our opinion, the proposed development is consistent with the anticipated future context of Cronulla

## The reasonableness of the impacts of the proposed development, particularly the impact on Monro Park

- as discussed, the proposed additional floor space has been carefully considered in order to reduce its visual prominence and mitigate any potential impacts
- specifically, the proposed additional floor space has been specifically distributed to ensure that the proposed development results in no additional overshadowing of Monro Park, above that resulting from a fully complaint scheme
- additionally, the proposed development does not result in any material additional impacts on privacy to or views from neighbouring residential developments

## In our opinion, the impacts of the proposed development are acceptable and reasonable for this type and scale of development.

#### The architectural merit of the proposed development

- the reference scheme which accompanies the planning proposal outlines a high quality, well articulated and attractive response
- as such, the proposed development is likely to present well in the locality, be attractive and inviting to users and set an appropriate standard for future development in the centre.
- additionally, further design development of the proposal will occur during the progress of the application at DA stage, allowing for detailed resolution of design elements and facades

#### In our opinion, the design of the proposed development is appropriate and has the potential to contribute positively to the area.

In our opinion, not only is the planning proposal appropriate for the subject site, the development it would enable has urban design merit.

As such, in our opinion the planning proposal is well founded and capable of support.